THE ROLE OF WOMEN IN WORKING LIFE IN TURKEY

DENIZ KAGNICIOGLU
Faculty of Economics and Administrative Sciences, Anadolu University, Turkey

ABSTRACT
Today’s transformations undergone in working life cause conflicts between individuals’ roles in working life and daily life. As the responsibilities and roles in working life increase, meeting the requirements of being a spouse, mother, father, etc. become harder; in the same manner, prioritizing family life generates certain problems in working life. In Turkey, in spite of some gender equity reforms over last ten years, the Turkish welfare regime still has some inequality problems in terms of generations and genders. However, women’s low activity rate is still the most critical characteristic of the labour market. This study aims to examine the major features of Turkish welfare regimes and family policies. Some historical reasons and social norms which effect the gender-based discrimination and segregation of work in the labour market are also analysed. For better seeing the relationship between work–life balance and gender equality in working life in Turkey, mostly comparative data on family policies, the labour market, and demographic indicators from the OECD, EU, and the Turkish Statistic Institute are used.

Keywords: women’s employment, gender equality, work–life balance, Turkey, gender-based discrimination, family policies.

1 INTRODUCTION
The size and quality of human capital in countries is one of the key driving forces behind economic and social development. As representing half of the world population, more engagement of women in the workforce improves the social status of women and increases their share in development and growth. However, independently of being traditional or modern, eastern or western, it is a reality that women are more disadvantaged than men in all societies. Nonetheless, there is a wide gap between men and women in terms of the rights and opportunities in developing and underdeveloped countries. Küçük [1] stated that, in all countries from West Africa to Central Asia, women are stuck in a situation where society expects them to solely fulfil the traditional roles of good mother, good wife, and good housewife. The best way women can change the old perceptions is by taking more part in economic life.

The key factors of increasing the role of women in economic and social life rely on gender equality defining that all human beings are free to develop their personal abilities and to make choices without being restricted by stereotypes or clichés imposed. Equality between women and men is a human right and the main principle that forms the basis of democratic societies. Aytaç et al. [2] implied that, Turkey is one of the countries where the role of the women in society is rapidly changing in the world. More women have been entering the ranks of paid employment by the legal and institutional structures for the termination of gender segregation and unequal treatment of women.

In Turkey, the legal rights that women can exercise are quite sufficient but Turkey’s labour force participation rates of women are markedly lower than those in developed nations, and even among some developing countries. The labour force participation rate of population aged 15 and over is 50.5%, this rate was 71.3% for males and 30.3% for females in 2014. This is the lowest female participation rate among OECD countries, and one of the lowest globally. Buğra [3] stated that, although modernization along with economic growth,
legal-institutional reforms and cultural matters converts the perception of gender roles, the current state of female employment is a reflection of traditional gender-based divisions carried into the labour market in Turkey.

2 FACTORS AFFECTING WOMEN’S PARTICIPATION IN THE LABOUR MARKET IN TURKEY

Women’s labour force participation is a complex issue as it ensues from a combination of economic, cultural, and social factors. The recent legislative changes, promoting gender equality in employment and in workplaces, do not seem sufficient in improving women’s labour market position. While most women remain out of the labour market, many of working women take place in informal and insecure jobs. Urbanization and the consequent decrease in agricultural employment, the low education level of women, domestic responsibilities and other socio-cultural conditions are frequently cited as factors affecting women’s employment. Women’s household responsibilities are top reasons of women’s not being able to participate in labour force with a rate of 57.6%. And education/training follows this with the rate of 11.2 [4].

2.1 Education

Education level is one of the most important factors effecting women’s participation to the labour market. Soyseçkin [5] mentioned that, as the education level of women increases, their labour force participation rate gets higher (Table 1). Moreover, the education level as a factor do not only promote the wage increase and facilitate to increase the opportunity of finding job easier for women but also ensuring them legal rights in terms of any challenges either in business life or in society.

In Turkey, the level of schooling is still low for women even though progress in enrolment has been made over the past decades by the state-sponsored education campaign [6]. Compulsory education was increased to 8 years by the government. This progress has no reflection on employment status and rate of labour participation of women yet. This reality puts them in a disadvantaged position in labour market compared to men, who do somewhat better than women in schooling. However, while the education level has positive effects on labour participation of women, it is not enough for eliminating the gender inequalities. According to Income and Living Conditions Survey 2014 results, a working woman who graduated from higher education has 1.3% lower income than a working man having same education level [7].

Table 1: Labour force participation of women in respect of education level. (Source: Turkish Statistical Institute Women in Statistics, 2014.)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2014</th>
<th>Labour force participation rate</th>
<th>Unemployment rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The illiterate</td>
<td>16.0</td>
<td>3.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Those educated below high school</td>
<td>25.8</td>
<td>9.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High school</td>
<td>31.9</td>
<td>19.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vocational or technical high school</td>
<td>39.8</td>
<td>19.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tertiary education</td>
<td>71.3</td>
<td>15.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2.2 Marital status

Women in Turkey generally suffer from the cultural attitudes and values towards their employment that directly related to the patriarchal prejudgments according to Yenilmez [8]. As it is mentioned above, “engaging in domestic work” is the biggest reason of why women are not included in labour force. Being a house wife is the first reason not to participate in the labour force (58%) before disability, health and illness (13%) and being enrolled in education and training. According to the statistics in 2012, while the percentage of “married” men employed in cities is 71.8, the corresponding rate drops down to 20.5 percent in “married women” [9].

Koten [9] also stated that, marriage is advantageous for men in terms of the active participation in his paid business life, whereas it culminates in disadvantages for women in this respect; this phenomenon can be observed rather readily at the stage of recruitment for married women with children or expecting a child definitely constitutes a detriment even if they are highly competitive, well-informed, educated and/or skilled.

2.3 Urbanization

Buğra and Çakar [10] have revealed that urbanization and decline in agricultural employment are two main factors that have contributed to decrease the share of women having or seeking job in Turkey. The very high proportion of women engaged in unpaid family work in the agriculture sector by the rate of 29% for women and 5% for men in 2015 [11]. Depending on urbanization, women migrated from a rural environment where they are in unpaid agriculture to a low participation urban environment where mostly they stay at home. Consequently, female participation in the labour market in rural areas has been decreasing because of urbanization. Besides, the agricultural sector is no longer the primary sector of employment for women. There is a significant shift from agriculture to service sector between 2000–2014. However, the rate of employed women in agriculture without social security is still high revealing that the decline in women’s employment in agriculture did not substantially pull down the rate of employed women in the informal sector, according to the official statistics [12].

In urban areas women mostly engage in three forms of informal work activities. The first form is the industrial home-based work of women. The second form of informal work comprises women employed in the urban areas for their families without payment. And the third comprises women employed as domestic workers and carrying out housework and care services. According to the OECD [13], among informal activities that women are employed in the highest share belongs to manufacturing sector with 35% in 2013, which was followed by the wholesale and retail commerce with 27%. Human healthcare and social service activities came third with 19.2%. The rate of informal employment in the manufacturing sector among men is 14% which is quite lower than women.

2.4 Work and life balance

Reconciliation of work and family life (work–life balance) is essential for gender equality. Balancing women’s home related responsibilities would increase the women’s participation in the labour [14]. In Turkey, prejudices about the gender roles in society reinforce different types of roles among men and women. The male role is expected to be main source of their family income i.e., ‘head of the household or breadwinner’ and the female role is proposed to be mother and housewife and their primary assignment is domestic jobs and only secondly
as workers. Domestic work constitutes one of the major obstacles of women in contributing the labour force in Turkey. Findings have shown that Turkish men spend far less time doing domestic work than men from other countries, while Turkish women spend far longer than the average [15]. Even the modern and more educated Turkish woman tends to be conflicted about working outside of the home, which is mainly associated with guilt over responsibilities to their families.

Koten [9] stated that, domestic responsibilities of women not only create the problem of work–life balance but also contribute the women’s inferior position in the labour market. For example, because of their domestic responsibilities it is believed that women are not as reliable as male workers, and they withdraw from their work when they become a mother or when they get married [16]. So, it is assumed that the turnover rate is higher than that of men and attachment to work is lower. These beliefs and assumptions affect female education and on the job training as well. Employer’s belief about women’s weak attachment to work makes employers not to support women workers to enjoy on the job training. As men, employers think that women workers would leave their job when they marry or become mothers. Consequently, women are not promoted to higher position even if they have the same qualifications and experience with men.

Childcare responsibility is the most important one among domestic responsibilities for women. Researches show that possibility of women with children to participate into labour market is less likely compared to women with no child. According to Soyseçkin [5], in Turkey, accessing the high quality and widespread childcare especially for 0-6 years old children is determining on women’s decision to work or not. This situation directly reflects to the ratio of women’s employment in Turkey. For example, compared to OECD 2013 average, women’s employment rate having at least one child between 3 and 5 years old is very low (21.4% for Turkey and OECD average is 63.3%).

3 GENDER-BASED DIVISION OF WORK

As it is stated above, beliefs about differences between the genders that are grounded in traditional cultural values contribute to the persistence of gender discrimination [9]. The effect of patriarchal culture on gender roles has been revealed by some researches. One of this researches named “Public Perceptions on Gender Roles and Status of Women in Turkey” conducted by Kadir Has University on March 2016 showed that 72.2% of women responded negatively to the question “Would you like to work?” The women cited as needing the following to consider working: 47.9% father/husband/family permission, 41.5% education and 27.9% safe work environment [17].

On the other hand, the status of women determined by tradition, custom and religion affect the wages, promotion and hiring of women in Turkey. Since it is thought that women are dependent on men and the main breadwinners are men, then they must be paid more. Assuming that all women in society lived with a man, either their husband or their father gives rise to see the women’s wage as a supplement to the men’s. Therefore, lower pay and lower position of women in the labour market is not accepted as problematic by the society.

Kaya [16] stated that, the government may also discriminate against women to protect the dominant group (males) by constraining the occupations open to women workers. In Turkey, some protective legislation prohibits and restrains women from specific jobs require physical activities like weightlifting. For example, according to legal regulations all types of underground and underwater works are forbidden to women. Moreover, women are banned from night work in industry with the exception of occupations in accordance with the regulation prepared. Furthermore, institutional factors affect occupational gender segregation in Turkey. Believing that women are physically weaker than men results the assumption that
they are naturally appropriate to certain types of work called “light jobs”. This ideology creates a labour market in which women are employed in labour intensive and lower paid jobs and men are employed in capital intensive and better paid jobs [16].

Gender-based division of work contributes the idea that the survival of women in labour market is dependent on the prerequisite of avoiding anything that could harm their role of being a wife and a mother at home. For supporting the gender roles in society, government promotes to women some specific type of work status like flexible labour. In Turkey, as breadwinner, it is believed that men are less willing to work flexibly which creates uncertainty in wages, working hours and retirement when compared to women who prefer to work flexibly to balance work-family life. As of today, the changes in the Labour Law numbered 4857 analysed below were also based on the main perception that the primary role and responsibilities of women were to become a wife and a mother.

The fact that the legal regulations made for women under the name of “flexibilization of work” are presented to the society as if they were “favours done for women” but the implementations that will affect the status of women in the labour market in a negative way are, on the contrary, presented in such a way that they are positive [9]. Flexible working rights like maternity leave, child care facilities in the workplaces with 150 female employees make women less preferred by the employers and cause problem in recruitment and promotion process. So, while more flexible conditions make women to enter the labour market easier but on the other hand working in part-time jobs, in turn, will cause women to exist in the labour market temporarily, for a short-term or seasonally, and to stay behind men in the career path. According to OECD, 23.4% of women were in part–time employment in 2010 compared to 6.7% of men in Turkey [13]. According to the EU [18], because hours worked are usually connected to the promotion into higher positions and the participation in the economic decision-making process, part-time working women have comparatively limited opportunities and high risk of old-age poverty due to low pension-related incomes in Turkey.

On the other hand, it is important to emphasize that the percentage of Turkish women in high-status professions is quite high even in comparison to many other industrialized western countries [6]. For example, 42% of architects, 40% of lawyers and 43% of academics were women in Turkey in 2014. Moreover, in urban areas, 21% of employed women were regarded as managers, professionals, technicians and associate professionals in 2014. However, although women frequently work in high skill and technical professions, this situation does not reflect their managerial position. In 2014, while 7.4% of employed men worked in professional occupations and 6.6% of them were regarded as managers, 13.9% of employed women are professional, but only 2.4% are in management positions. With these rates, Turkey is the lowest performing country in the OECD, with a rank of 125th among 142 countries in 2014, based on managerial and decision making position of women [12]. This result also reflects gender role stereotypes such as perceiving women to be lower on task-orientation and emotional stability than both men and successful managers and Sevig [19] stated that, these attributes are seen as barriers to women’s advancement to executive and strategic decision-making positions. Aycan [20] also suggested that men have more negative attitudes towards women in management due to women’s family-related roles and responsibilities.

Gender differences in earning is also very dramatic issue in Turkish labour market. According to the Global Gender Report prepared by World Economic Forum (2014), Turkey ranked 87th in wage equality among 131 countries. Although there has been a slight improvement on this figure over the year, Turkey is still behind the most of the OECD and EU-27 countries in terms of wage equality. There are two main reasons of this picture. First,
employment opportunities for women are generally concentrated on certain sectors paying low wages such as textile and ready-made garment industries. Second, in most of the sectors and occupations women work, they generally earn less than men. Moreover, the gender pay gap between men and women does not change even taking education into account. Approximately on the all education levels, men receive higher earnings than women. So, the wage gap cannot be explained by the differences between men’s and women’s human capital but by their gender.

4 THE EFFECT OF WELFARE STATE REGIME OF TURKEY ON EMPLOYMENT OF WOMEN

As it is mentioned above, female participation of labour is a very complex issue as a combination of economic, cultural and social factors in a country. In addition to these factors, the welfare state regime is a variable that reflects the state’s deliberate social policies, and can play a significant role in changing attitudes and the institutional arrangements which characterize labour markets. Thus, apart from economic, social, and cultural conditions in a given country, the state can alter the balance between employment and “staying at home” with “women-friendly” social policies to challenge the existing patriarchal attitudes and minimize the opportunity costs for women’s employment.

The distribution of welfare through social policies, and the social risks absorbed through the family are important factors affecting individuals’ economic choices. Bozçağa [21] stated that, Welfare state models with either familalistic policies, which actively aim to strengthen the family’s caring function, or passive family policies, which compel the family to absorb social risks, aggravate women’s care responsibilities and create a gender-based inequality of opportunities in terms of their access to paid work.

Bozçağa [21] implies three pillars of family policies determining the women’s employment status: the length of leave policies, the transfers and rights attached to caregiving, and the public provision of care. By taking into account these pillars, Turkey is categorized as a model that maximizes the family’s caring function because of its passive family policies even though there have recently been some attempts for active family policies in the country.

4.1 Maternal rights and leave

Maternity, paternity and parental leave—or any other type of additional shared leave—are closely associated with women’s economic participation in many parts of the world and are thus an important element of policies aimed at more efficient use of the country’s human capital pool. Parental benefits enabling mothers, fathers or both who take paid or unpaid time off to care for a child following birth can increase women’s participation in the workforce and foster a more equitable division of child caring. However, these benefits can undermine women’s labour force participation. For example, in economies where the cumulative duration of paid maternity and parental leave available for mothers exceeds two years, female labour force participation is lower.

As it is mentioned above, the rights related to childbirth and adoptions, which are arranged in Labour Law No. 4857 has undergone significant changes in 2016 and new types of rights and leaves are introduced for mothers, parents and adopter of a child. According to new regulations, in pregnancy process, pregnant women cannot be forced to work more than 7.5 hours, or in nightshift in their pregnancy period. There is also some improvement in maternity leave system with revision of Labour Law. In principle, female employees must not be engaged in work for a total period of sixteen weeks, eight weeks before confinement
and eight weeks after confinement. Mother can take an unpaid leave of up to six months after the expiry of the sixteen weeks, or in the case of multiple pregnancy, after the expiry of the eighteen weeks. Female employees shall be allowed to a total of one and a half hour nursing leave in order to enable them to feed their children below the age of one. The length of the nursing leave shall be treated as part of the daily working time [22].

After the maternity leave, working women, (or the male or female adopter of a child under three years of age), may work half time up to; sixty days on first childbirth, one hundred and twenty days on second, one hundred and eighty days for the third child.

4.2 Childcare assistance

As it is stated above childcare is an important factor in allowing women to reconcile professional and family obligations because women tend to bear the majority of the caregiving responsibilities in most countries. For example, a well-established day care system can be a long-term investment that supports women in the employment, thereby improving the efficiency of labour markets. Among the 87 countries surveyed by the World Economic Forum, childcare assistance varies between economies and includes public day care, private day care and homecare which is when one parent stays home and the other goes to work for which there may or may not be government assistance [23].

The public provision of daily childcare in Turkey is very low. According to World Bank, only very small percentage of children aged 0-3 take place in formal day care facilities and only half of all children aged 4–5 taking part in preschool education [24]. Formal kindergartens and pre-school nursery classes are operated by government as well as by the private school. The Labour Law also encourages childcare facilities at workplace in Turkey. The law obliged employers employing between 100 and 150 female workers to provide a nursery in the workplace and a childcare centre in workplaces employed more than 150 female employees. However, most of the companies in Turkey are small and medium sized workplaces and few employers employ 150 or more women. Moreover, some employers make effort to keep the number of women employees below 150 to avoid this regulation.

In Turkey, because public childcare services are very low or absent, working parents have to meet whole expenses of childcare [5] It is the women’s responsibility to find a solution to childcare problem and the solutions changing based on the income level of women. Women from lower income families need support of other female members to be able to work in paid jobs. Support for childcare is also frequently provided by members of the extended family, especially mothers and mothers-in-law. In absence of this family support, many women have to work as home based informal works with a low level of earning potential and open to occupational hazards [5]. However, the educated middle class women who mostly have formal jobs in well-paying occupations also need the support of their female family members because of insufficient childcare services. Middle-class professional women have more opportunities to reach unpaid care leaves and ability to pay for childcare. Also, childcare services are somewhat more affordable in Turkey than in the rest of the industrialized world. Many women work as in-home nannies and helpers for a relatively low cost.

4.3 Social security

Social security system also reflects the existing traditional gender roles and ideology in a society. Social security systems also have the potential of “gendering” social policies, by recreating gender roles within the family. According to Grütjen [25] and Kılıç [26], the Turkish social security regime is based on a normative family model according to which women and unmarried daughters are dependent on the status of the male head of the family.
This ideal type of a male breadwinner is also reflected in the survivor pension, which favours female over male survivors. Grütjen [25] also implies that, women left without a male breadwinner are protected by the state, until they get (re)married. The Turkish state also encourages women to (re)marry by additional payments. Hence, marriage is perceived as the “real social security mechanism for women”.

In this context, Dedeoğlu [27] stated that, women’s access to social security are related with formally employed male relatives. For example, daughters of insured persons have been entitled to healthcare insurance regardless of age as long as they are not married or formally employed. On the other hand, sons have been subjected to age limits and exempted from the conditions only in case of disability and destitution. Another example is Labour Law Article 14 which regulates severance pay, outlines that if a woman leaves her job within a year of marrying, she is entitled to severance pay but men are not entitled to such payment. This special treatment for women was originally explained by the lack of employment opportunities for women and by the family structure, which hinders women’s participation in the labour force in most cases. According to Dedeoğlu [27], a different treatment of the female children regarding survivor’s benefits is an encouragement for women to stay out of productive activities and focus on domestic roles, which thereby strengthens traditional gendered roles in Turkish society.

5 CONCLUSION

Turkey has experienced important structural and social changes that would be expected to facilitate women to enter the labour market. However, despite all these factors, female labour participation in Turkey is still low based on the international standards. The lack of affordable caring and social services, informality and unpaid female work, violence against women, early marriages, early school leaving and negative portrayal of women and gender stereotyping contribute to this situation. The traditional understanding of jobs for men and jobs for women further increases labour market segmentation. Patriarchal cultural structure still remains as the basic determinant of participation of women to the labour market, their survival and their advancement.

For overcoming the barriers which decrease the female labour participation, some steps should be taken by the government and institutions with collaboration of NGO’s which will support to change the gender prejudice in society. Some of the most important solutions are:

1. Increasing the level of education and training of women;
2. Expanding childcare and eldercare services;
3. Raising social awareness to abolish the traditional role structure based on gender;
4. Revising the existing Labour Act to obtain gender equality;
5. Implementing income-generating politics for rural women and improving labour conditions; and

Since it is decent, formal and paid employment that empowers people and especially women, some politics should be designed to provide women with employment in male dominated sectors where decent work opportunities are more prevalent. The more women engage in the workforce and become economically independent, the more this perception of women being inferior can be overcome, and the infringement of their rights can be prevented. Moreover, women’s awareness of gender inequality and discrimination in society rises with their economic and social independence. It is not possible a genuine and sustainable development if providing gender equality in working life is not seen as an urgent issue in Turkey.
REFERENCES


