

# Learning from Failure

---

## Long-term Behaviour of Heavy Masonry Structures

**WIT***PRESS*

WIT Press publishes leading books in Science and Technology.

Visit our website for the current list of titles.

[www.witpress.com](http://www.witpress.com)

**WIT***eLibrary*

Home of the Transactions of the Wessex Institute, the WIT electronic-library provides the international scientific community with immediate and permanent access to individual papers presented at WIT conferences. Visit the WIT eLibrary at

<http://library.witpress.com>

# **International Series on Advances in Architecture**

## **Objectives**

The field of architecture has experienced considerable advances in the last few years, many of them connected with new methods and processes, the development of faster and better computer systems and a new interest in our architectural heritage. It is to bring such advances to the attention of the international community that this book series has been established. The object of the series is to publish state-of-the-art information on architectural topics with particular reference to advances in new fields, such as virtual architecture, intelligent systems, novel structural forms, material technology and applications, restoration techniques, movable and lightweight structures, high rise buildings, architectural acoustics, leisure structures, intelligent buildings and other original developments. The Advances in Architecture series consists of a few volumes per year, each under the editorship - by invitation only - of an outstanding architect or researcher. This commitment is backed by an illustrious Editorial Board. Volumes in the Series cover areas of current interest or active research and include contributions by leaders in the field.

---

## **Managing Editor**

**F. Escrig**

Escuela de Arquitectura  
Universidad de Sevilla  
Spain

---

## **Honorary Editors**

**C. A. Brebbia**

Wessex Institute of Technology  
UK

**P. R. Vazquez**

Estudio de Arquitectura  
Mexico

## Associate Editors

**C. Alessandri**

University of Ferrara  
Italy

**F. Butera**

Politecnico di Milano  
Italy

**J. Chilton**

University of Lincoln  
UK

**G. Croci**

University of Rome, La Sapienza  
Italy

**A. de Naeyer**

University of Ghent  
Belgium

**W. P. De Wilde**

Free University of Brussel  
Belgium

**C. Gantes**

National Technical University of Athens  
Greece

**K. Ghavami**

Pontificia Univ. Católica, Rio de Janeiro  
Brazil

**K. Ishii**

Yokohama National University  
Japan

**W. Jäger**

Technical University of Dresden  
Germany

**M. Majowiecki**

University of Bologna  
Italy

**S. Sánchez-Beitia**

University of the Basque Country  
Spain

**J. J. Sendra**

Universidad de Sevilla  
Spain

**M. Zador**

Technical University of Budapest  
Hungary

**R. Zarnic**

University of Ljubljana  
Slovenia



# Learning from Failure

---

## Long-term Behaviour of Heavy Masonry Structures

**Editor:**

L. Binda  
*Politecnico di Milano, Italy*

**WIT**PRESS Southampton, Boston



**Editor:**

**L. Binda**

*Politecnico di Milano, Italy*

Published by

**WIT Press**

Ashurst Lodge, Ashurst, Southampton, SO40 7AA, UK

Tel: 44 (0) 238 029 3223; Fax: 44 (0) 238 029 2853

E-Mail: [witpress@witpress.com](mailto:witpress@witpress.com)

<http://www.witpress.com>

For USA, Canada and Mexico

**WIT Press**

25 Bridge Street, Billerica, MA 01821, USA

Tel: 978 667 5841; Fax: 978 667 7582

E-Mail: [infousa@witpress.com](mailto:infousa@witpress.com)

<http://www.witpress.com>

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

A Catalogue record for this book is available  
from the British Library

ISBN: 978-1-84564-057-6

ISSN: 1368-1435

Library of Congress Catalog Card Number: 2007922340

*The texts of the papers in this volume were set  
individually by the authors or under their supervision.*

No responsibility is assumed by the Publisher, the Editors and Authors for any injury and/or damage to persons or property as a matter of products liability, negligence or otherwise, or from any use or operation of any methods, products, instructions or ideas contained in the material herein. The Publisher does not necessarily endorse the ideas held, or views expressed by the Editors or Authors of the material contained in its publications.

© WIT Press 2008

Printed in Great Britain by Athenaeum Press Ltd.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without the prior written permission of the Publisher.

# Contents

<b>Preface .....</b>	<b>xiii</b>
<b>Chapter 1</b>	
<b>Failures due to long-term behaviour of heavy structures.....</b>	<b>1</b>
<i>L. Binda, A. Anzani &amp; A. Saisi</i>	
1.1 Introduction .....	1
1.2 The collapse of the Civic Tower of Pavia: search for the cause .....	2
1.2.1 Description and historic evolution of the tower .....	3
1.2.2 First experimental results and interpretation of the failure causes .....	4
1.2.2.1 Structure and morphology of the walls.....	4
1.2.2.2 Geotechnical investigation.....	6
1.2.2.3 Physical, chemical and mechanical tests on the components .....	7
1.2.2.4 Compression tests on masonry prisms.....	8
1.2.3 Long-term tests .....	9
1.2.3.1 Fatigue tests .....	9
1.2.3.2 Constant load tests .....	11
1.3 Long-term behaviour of masonry structures .....	12
1.3.1 Deformation during mortar hardening.....	12
1.3.2 First, secondary and tertiary creep in rock and hardened masonry .....	15
1.4 Collapse and damage of towers due to long-term heavy loads.....	16
1.4.1 St. Marco bell-tower and St. Maria Magdalena tower in Goch .....	16
1.4.2 The bell-tower of Monza Cathedral and the Torrazzo of Cremona .....	16
1.5 The role of investigation on the interpretation of the damage causes .....	17
1.5.1 The bell-tower of the Cathedral of Monza .....	18
1.5.2 The ‘Torrazzo’ of Cremona.....	21

1.6	Comparison between the two towers .....	25
1.7	Conclusions .....	26

## Chapter 2

<b>Experimental researches into long-term behaviour of historical masonry.....</b>	<b>29</b>
--	-----------

*A. Anzani, L. Binda & G. Mirabella Roberti*

2.1	Introduction .....	29
2.2	Tests on the masonry of the Civic Tower of Pavia .....	31
2.2.1	Characterization by sonic tests .....	33
2.2.2	Monotonic tests on prisms of different dimensions .....	33
2.2.3	Fatigue tests .....	35
2.2.4	Creep tests on prisms of $300 \times 300 \times 510$ mm.....	36
2.2.5	Pseudo-creep tests on prisms of $100 \times 100 \times 180$ mm.....	39
2.2.6	Pseudo-creep tests on prisms of $200 \times 200 \times 350$ mm.....	39
2.3	Tests on the masonry of the crypt of the Cathedral of Monza .....	42
2.3.1	Preparation of prisms of $200 \times 200 \times 350$ mm.....	42
2.3.2	Characterization by sonic tests .....	44
2.3.3	Monotonic tests.....	45
2.3.4	Fatigue tests .....	45
2.3.5	Creep test on one prism of $300 \times 300 \times 510$ mm .....	48
2.3.6	Pseudo-creep tests, first series .....	48
2.3.7	Pseudo-creep tests, second series .....	50
2.4	Comments.....	52

## Chapter 3

<b>Collapse prediction and creep effects.....</b>	<b>57</b>
---	-----------

*P.B. Lourenço & J. Pina-Henriques*

3.1	Introduction .....	57
3.2	Short-term compression: failure analysis and collapse prediction using numerical simulations .....	58
3.2.1	Experimental results .....	58
3.2.2	Continuum model .....	59
3.2.3	Particle model .....	62
3.2.4	Discussion of the results .....	63
3.3	Long-term compression: experimental assessment.....	66
3.3.1	Tested specimens .....	66
3.3.2	Standard compression tests.....	68
3.3.3	Short-term creep tests .....	69
3.3.4	Long-term creep tests .....	71
3.3.5	Discussion of the results .....	74
3.4	Conclusions and future work .....	78

## Chapter 4

### **Effects of creep on new masonry structures..... 83**

*N.G. Shrive & M.M. Reda Taha*

4.1	Introduction .....	83
4.2	The step-by-step in time approach to modeling time-dependent effects .....	84
4.3	Case 1: An axially loaded column .....	85
4.3.1	Creep model.....	85
4.3.2	Effect of coupling creep and damage in concentrically loaded columns.....	89
4.3.3	Examining the effect of rehabilitation .....	91
4.4	Case 2: Composite structural element subject to bending .....	92
4.4.1	Development of model .....	92
4.4.2	Application to a beam.....	97
4.4.3	Masonry walls subject to axial load and bending.....	103
4.5	New mathematical approaches to modeling creep.....	103
4.6	Discussion .....	104
4.7	Conclusions .....	105

## Chapter 5

### **Experimental study on the damaged pillars**

### **of the Noto Cathedral ..... 109**

*A. Saisi, L. Binda, L. Cantini & C. Tedeschi*

5.1	Introduction .....	109
5.2	The collapse and the decision for reconstruction.....	109
5.3	On-site investigation on the remaining parts of the collapsed pillars.....	110
5.3.1	Layout of the section and of the masonry morphology .....	111
5.3.2	General characterisation of the materials .....	111
5.3.3	Damage description .....	114
5.3.4	Laboratory testing.....	114
5.3.4.1	Mortars.....	115
5.3.4.2	Stones.....	115
5.3.4.3	Injectability tests .....	117
5.3.5	On-site tests .....	117
5.3.5.1	Flat-Jack tests.....	117
5.3.5.2	Application of sonic pulse velocity test to pillars.....	118
5.3.6	Design decisions .....	119
5.3.7	The dismantling of the remaining pillars.....	120

## Chapter 6

### Monitoring of long-term damage in long-span

#### masonry constructions..... 125

*P. Roca, G. Martínez, F. Casarin, C. Modena, P.P. Rossi,*

*I. Rodríguez & A. Garay*

6.1	Introduction .....	125
6.2	Monitoring and long-term damage.....	125
6.3	Role of monitoring in the study of ancient constructions .....	127
6.4	Monitoring: methodology and requirements.....	128
6.4.1	Technology .....	128
6.4.2	Distinction between dynamic and static monitoring .....	129
6.4.3	Requirements .....	131
6.5	Measuring damage and deformation related to historical or long-term processes .....	133
6.5.1	Monitoring and long-term damage .....	133
6.5.2	Structural deformation .....	133
6.5.3	Tensile damage in arches and vaults .....	135
6.5.4	Damage of compressed members .....	135
6.5.5	Fragmentation .....	139
6.6	Structural modelling and monitoring .....	140
6.7	Case studies .....	141
6.7.1	Dynamic monitoring of Mallorca Cathedral .....	141
6.7.2	S. Maria Assunta Cathedral, Reggio Emilia, Italy .....	145
6.7.3	Vitoria Cathedral .....	148
6.8	Conclusions .....	151

## Chapter 7

### Modelling of the long-term behaviour of historical

#### masonry towers ..... 153

*A. Taliercio & E. Papa*

7.1	Introduction .....	153
7.2	A continuum damage model for masonry creep .....	154
7.2.1	Unidimensional viscoelastic model with damage .....	154
7.2.2	Three-dimensional viscoelastic model with damage.....	157
7.2.3	Identification of the model parameters and comparisons with experimental results.....	160
7.3	Structural analyses of two masonry towers.....	166
7.3.1	The Civic Tower of Pavia.....	166
7.3.2	The bell-tower of Monza Cathedral.....	167
7.4	Remarks and future perspectives .....	171

## Chapter 8

### Repair techniques and long-term damage of massive

structures ..... 175

*C. Modena & M.R. Valluzzi*

8.1	Introduction .....	175
8.2	The bed reinforcement technique.....	176
8.3	The experimental campaigns.....	178
8.3.1	Laboratory tests on the use of stainless steel bars .....	179
8.3.2	Laboratory tests on the use of CFRP bars and thin strips.....	183
8.4	Case studies .....	197
8.4.1	The bell-tower of the Basilica of S. Giustina in Padua .....	197
8.4.2	The pillars of S. Sofia church in Padua .....	199
8.4.3	The bell-tower of S. Giovanni Battista Cathedral in Monza (Milan).....	199
8.5	Final remarks.....	201

## Chapter 9

### Simple checks to prevent the collapse of heavy historical structures and residual life prevision through a probabilistic model .....

205

*L. Binda, A. Anzani & E. Garavaglia*

9.1	Introduction .....	205
9.2	The safety of ancient towers .....	205
9.2.1	A survey on Italian cases .....	206
9.2.2	Comments on the observed crack patterns .....	206
9.2.3	Elaboration of the collected data .....	209
9.3	A probabilistic model for the assessment of historic buildings .....	210
9.4	Fragility curves from the experimental data .....	215
9.4.1	Fragility curve versus $\sigma$ applied to creep tests .....	215
9.4.2	Comparison between vertical and horizontal strain-rate .....	215
9.4.3	Fragility curve versus $\sigma$ applied to pseudo-creep tests .....	216
9.4.4	Comparison between vertical and horizontal strain-rate .....	218
9.5	Application to the bell-tower of Monza .....	219
9.6	Conclusions .....	221

**Conclusions..... 225**



## Preface

On March 17 1989, the Civic Tower of Pavia collapsed without any apparent warning signs – killing four people. Subsequently, L. Binda, together with four colleagues from DIS, Politecnico of Milan, was nominated a member of a Committee that had the aim of helping the Prosecutor of the Procura della Repubblica in Milan find the causes of the collapse. After an experimental and analytical investigation lasting nine months, the collapse cause was found. Progressive damage dating back many years, due mainly to the heavy dead load put on top of the existing medieval tower with the addition of a massive bell-tower in granite, was to blame.

This type of long-term behaviour of masonry structures was not as well researched as it was for concrete and steel structures and for rocks. Experimental research aimed at showing the reliability of this interpretation was carried out, and is still continuing, that is more than sixteen years of research since 1989. After careful interpretation of the experimental results, also based on experiences from rock mechanics and concrete, the modelling of the phenomenon for massive structures, such as creep behaviour of masonry, was implemented by collaboration with E. Papa and A. Taliercio from the same department.

Other case histories were collected such as the collapse of the Sancta Maria Magdalena bell-tower in 1992 in Dusseldorf, the damage to the bell-tower of the Monza Cathedral, Italy, and to the Torrazzo in Cremona, Italy. Later on, in 1996 the collapse of the Noto Cathedral, Italy, showed that similar progressive damage can take place in pillars of churches and cathedrals.

Collaborations on the topic first started with the University of Padua (C. Modena) and later on with the University of Minho, Portugal (P. Lourenco). Then the University of Calgary, Canada (N. Shrive) and the University of Barcelona (P. Roca) were involved.

The editor would like to thank the technicians Mr Antico, Mr Cucchi and Mr Iscandri for their collaboration in the experimental research and Mrs C. Arcadi for her help in the editing of the chapters.

The Editor  
2007